



University of São Paulo – USP

Department of Philosophy and Theory of Law

**DFD5924 – Contemporary Themes and Readings in Legal Theory III**

Professor: Ronaldo Porto Macedo Júnior

**Class Time:** Thursdays, from 8:30 am to 12:30 pm

**Place:** Miguel Reale Room (3<sup>rd</sup> Floor).

**Texts available at:** <https://edisciplinas.usp.br/course/view.php?id=121764>.

**Password:** wittgenstein2024.

**CALENDAR**

CLASS	DATE	CONTENT
N. 1	15.08	Course Introduction
N. 2	22.08	<b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>James Rachels – "Can Ethics Provide Answers?" in Can Ethics Provide Answers? And Other Essays in Moral Philosophy by James Rachels, Rowman &amp; Littlefield Publishers, pages 21-49.</li></ul> <b><u>Recommended Reading:</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Practical Ethics, Chapter 01 by Peter Singer.</li></ul>
N. 3	23.08 (10 am – 12 pm)	<b><u>Special Class for the Course: Exceptionally on Friday</u></b> <b><u>LECTURE – PROF. BRIAN BIX</u></b> <b><u>Theme:</u></b> Problems about Truth in Law. <b><u>Panel:</u></b> Brian Bix, Ronaldo Macedo, and Clarissa Grossman. <b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>BIX, Brian. On law and truth. 2024. pp. 1-28.</li></ul> <b><u>Recommended Reading:</u></b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>BIX, Brian. "The application (and mis-application) of Wittgenstein's rule-following considerations to legal theory" in Law, Language and Legal Determinacy. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993. pp. 36-62.</li></ul>
N. 4	29.08	<b><u>Special Class for the Course</u></b> <b><u>LECTURE – PROF. ANTÓNIO CAEIRO</u></b>

		<p><b>Theme:</b> Presentation of Professor Caeiro's new book: "<i>What is Philosophy?</i>".</p> <p><b>Panel:</b> A. Caeiro, E. Wolf, and Nuno M. Coelho.</p> <p><b>Mandatory Reading:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wittgenstein: The possibility of transparency; language game; making sense, in <i>What is Philosophy?</i> by António de Castro Caeiro, pp. 255-304.</li> </ul> <p><b>Recommended Lecture:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>August 30th, Friday, 9:15 am to 12:15 pm: "Justice and Passions" (Panel: A. Caeiro, M. Zingano, L. F. Barzotto).</li> </ul>
05/09	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>INDEPENDENCE WEEK – NO CLASSES</b></p> <p><b>Recommended Lectures:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ronald Dworkin - Is There Truth in Interpretation? <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ej1rarGNWp8">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ej1rarGNWp8</a></li> <li>Thomas Nagel - Objectivity at Holberg Prize Symposium 2007: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9OU9QTFvOuk">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9OU9QTFvOuk</a></li> </ul> <p><b>Recommended Reading:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GUEST, Stephen. Dworkin, pp. 124-144, Chapter 07, "Objectivity in Law and Morality"</li> <li>DWORKIN, Ronald. "Legal Theory and the Problem of Sense." In: GAVISON, R. (Ed.). <i>Issues in Contemporary Legal Philosophy</i>. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1987.</li> <li>Dworkin, R. (1996). "Objectivity and Truth: You'd Better Believe It". <i>Philosophy &amp; Public Affairs</i>, 25(2), 87–139. [JSTOR](<a href="http://www.jstor.org/stable/2961920">http://www.jstor.org/stable/2961920</a>) or in [University of Chicago](<a href="https://cpb-us-w2.wpmucdn.com/voices.uchicago.edu/dist/9/177/files/2007/11/dworkin-objectivity-and-truth.pdf">https://cpb-us-w2.wpmucdn.com/voices.uchicago.edu/dist/9/177/files/2007/11/dworkin-objectivity-and-truth.pdf</a>) (Brazilian translation: "Objetividade e Verdade: Melhor Você Acreditar" by Ronald Dworkin)</li> <li>STAVROPOULOS, Nicos. "Interpretivist Theories of Law." In: ZALTA, Edward (Ed.). <i>Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy</i>, 2008</li> </ul>	
	N. 5	12.09

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• O Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus de Wittgenstein by Luiz Henrique Lopes dos Santos, in Lições de História da Filosofia, Silvia Altmann and Eduardo Wolf (eds.), Editora da Cidade.</li> <li>• HACKING, Ian. Por que a Linguagem Interessa à Filosofia? UNESP.</li> <li>• FREGE, Gottlob. "Sense and Reference" (pp. 59-87), in Frege, Gottlob, Lógica e Filosofia da Linguagem, trans. Paulo Alcoforado, 2nd Edition, EDUSP</li> <li>• FREGE, Gottlob. "On Concept and Object" (pp. 87-104), in Frege, Gottlob, Lógica e Filosofia da Linguagem, trans. Paulo Alcoforado, 2nd Edition, EDUSP. (Both texts included in the renowned English translation: Translations from the Philosophical Writings of Gottlob Frege. Oxford: Blackwell, 1960).</li> <li>• FREGE, Gottlob. The Thought. A Logical Investigation. In: Paulo Alcoforado (Ed.). Cadernos de Tradução: Investigações Lógicas e Outros Ensaios. Trans. and notes by Paulo Alcoforado. São Paulo: EDIPE.</li> <li>• KENNY, Anthony John Patrick. Wittgenstein, Rev. ed. 2005, pp. 1-34</li> <li>• SANTOS, Luiz Henrique Lopes dos. The Essence of the Proposition and the Essence of the World. In: WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. São Paulo: Edusp, 2001.</li> </ul>
N. 6	19.09	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• HS, Wittgenstein, Chapters: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. The Prodigious Diversity of Language Games, pp. 57.</li> <li>5. Families and Resemblances, pp. 76.</li> <li>6. Our Unsurveyable Grammar, pp. 95.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b><u>Recommended Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SCHMITZ, François. Wittgenstein, São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 2004. pp. 83-136</li> <li>• HACKER, Peter. Insight and Illusion – Themes in the Philosophy of Wittgenstein (extensively revised edition) (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1986, hereafter HACKER, II, Chapter I (pp. 1-27) and II (pp. 25-55)</li> <li>• RUSSELL, B. "On Denoting" (pp. 212-220), in A.P. Martinich (Ed.), The Philosophy of Language, 4th Edition, OUP.</li> <li>• RUSSELL, B. "Descriptions" (pp. 221-227), in A.P. Martinich (Ed.), The Philosophy of Language, 4th Edition, OUP.</li> <li>• KENNY, Anthony John Patrick. Wittgenstein, Rev. ed. 2005, pp. 36-44</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MCGINN, Marie. Elucidating the Tractatus: Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Logic and Language. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2006.</li> <li>• MORRIS, Michael. Routledge Philosophy GuideBook to Wittgenstein and the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. Routledge, 2008.</li> <li>• RUSSELL, B. "On Denotation" (pp. 9-20), in Russell - Moore Os Pensadores de Bertrand Russell; George Edward Moore, Editora Abril</li> <li>• RUSSELL, B. "On the Nature of Acquaintance" (pp. 21-58), in Russell - Moore Os Pensadores de Bertrand Russell; George Edward Moore, Editora Abril</li> <li>• HACKER, P. M. S. Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytic Philosophy. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996. pp. 1-35 (The Achievements of the Tractatus)</li> <li>• HACKER, P. M. S. Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytic Philosophy. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996. p. 39-66 (The Impact of the Tractatus)</li> <li>• HACKER, P. M. S. Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytic Philosophy. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996. p. 67-87 (The Inter-wars Years: Cambridge and Oxford)</li> </ul>
N. 7	26.09	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• HS, Wittgenstein, Chapters: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. Visible Rails Invisibly Laid to Infinity. p. 112.</li> <li>8. What Is the Use of Studying Philosophy?. p. 131.</li> <li>9. Index. p. 151.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b><u>Recommended Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SCHMITZ, François. Wittgenstein, São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 2004. p. 137-180</li> <li>• STERN, David G. Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction (Cambridge Introductions to Key Philosophical Texts). Cambridge University Press, 2004. (There is a Portuguese translation, unfortunately out of print: STERN, David G. As Investigações Filosóficas de Wittgenstein: uma Introdução. Translation by Marcelo Carvalho and Fernando L. Aquino. São Paulo: Annablume, 2012. (Coleção Filosofia e Linguagem)).</li> <li>• WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Philosophical Investigations, 4th ed. Edited by P. M. S. Hacker and Joachim Schulte. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009, (Hereafter: WITTGENSTEIN PI), §§1-25.</li> <li>• HACKER, Peter. Insight and Illusion – Themes in the Philosophy of Wittgenstein (extensively revised edition). Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1986, (Hereafter HACKER, II), Chapter I (pages 1-27) and Chapter II (pages 25-55).</li> <li>• MCGINN, Marie. Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations. London: Routledge, 1997.</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CAVELL, Stanley. "The Availability of Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy." In: PITCHER, George. The Philosophy of Wittgenstein. 2nd ed. New York: Anchor Books, 1966. p. 151-185.</li> </ul>
N. 8	03.10	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Norman Malcolm, Certainty, pp. 201-236, in Nothing is Hidden: Wittgenstein's Criticism of His Early Thoughts, Basil Blackwell, 1986.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Recommended Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Norman Malcolm, Certainty, pp. 201-236, in Nothing is Hidden: Wittgenstein's Criticism of His Early Thoughts, Basil Blackwell, 1986.</li> <li>• Ludwig Wittgenstein, On Certainty (DC), Ed. 70, Recommended aphorisms: 1-200.</li> <li>• Introdução de Sérgio Miranda a Sobre a Certeza de Wittgenstein 1ª. Parte pags. 11-46 Ludwig Wittgenstein, Da Certeza, (DC) Ed. 70, introdução de Sérgio Miranda, 2012. Recommended aphorisms: 201-400).</li> </ul>
<b>10.10 – NO CLASS – PUBLIC SELECTION FOR PROFESSOR OF DFD</b>		
N. 9	17.10	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• HERMANN, Julia. On Moral Certainty, Justification and Practice: A Wittgensteinian Perspective (OMC), Utrecht University, The Netherlands, Palgrave Macmillan, London (Hereafter: OMC). pp. 1-40. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Introduction (Chapter I).</li> <li>2. Basic Concepts (Chapter II).</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
N. 10	24.10	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• OMC, pp. 40-85. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. Certainty (Chapter III).</li> <li>4. Moral Justification (Chapter IV)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
N. 11	31.10	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pleasants, Nigel. (2008). "Wittgenstein, Ethics and Basic Moral Certainty." Inquiry, 51:3, 241-267. To link to this article: DOI: 10.1080/00201740802120673.</li> </ul>
<b>07.11 – NO CLASS – LECTURE – PROF. LARS VINX (CAMBRIDGE)</b>		
N. 12	14.11	<p style="text-align: center;"><b><u>Online Class (November 15<sup>th</sup> is a holiday)</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cecilie Eriksen, Julia Hermann, Neil O'Hara - Philosophical Perspectives on Moral Certainty. Routledge, 2022. pp. 1-19 (Introduction On Moral Certainty, by Neil O'Hara, Cecilie Eriksen, Julia Hermann, and Nigel Pleasants).</li> <li>• "Why On Certainty Matters," pp. 33-47, by Avrum Stroll, in Readings of Wittgenstein's On Certainty Edited by Daniele Moyal-Sharrock and William H. Brenner, 2005 by Palgrave Macmillan (Hereafter: WCM).</li> </ul>

		<p align="center"><b>Online Class (November 20<sup>th</sup> is Black Consciousness Day. There will be no class)</b></p>
N. 13	21.11	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• "Why Wittgenstein Isn't a Foundationalist" by Michael Williams, pp. 47-75 in WCM</li> <li>• Chapter One, "Which Hinge Epistemology?" pp. 3-21, in Wittgenstein Rehinged: The Relevance of On Certainty for Contemporary Epistemology by Annalisa Coliva.</li> </ul>
N. 14	28.11	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• "Unravelling Certainty" by Danièle Moyal-Sharrock, pp. 76-100 in WCM.</li> <li>• Wittgenstein's On Certainty and Contemporary Anti-scepticism," by Duncan Pritchard, pp. 189-225 in WCM.</li> </ul>
N. 15	05/12	<p><b><u>Mandatory Reading:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Wittgenstein and Ethics: A Discussion with Reference to On Certainty," by Alice Crary, pp. 275-301 in WCM.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Recommended Lectures:</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recording of Prof. Alice Crary: "Wittgenstein and Ethics," lecture given on June 2, 2005, at the "Wittgenstein, Philosophy &amp; Language" conference in Skjolden, Norway, June 1-4, 2005. Available at: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zFSrTirT_KA&amp;list=PLP9Rm_nC0LsHOvL869oI6dB9fMTj8cAjK&amp;index=32&amp;t=93s">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zFSrTirT_KA&amp;list=PLP9Rm_nC0LsHOvL869oI6dB9fMTj8cAjK&amp;index=32&amp;t=93s</a>.</li> </ul>

## **OBJECTIVES**

The course aims to develop students' ability to rigorously read complex texts while also encouraging reflection and the formation of critical reasoning based on the material read. Additionally, it seeks to provide a theoretical deepening on topics in Legal Theory beyond the legal positivism generally addressed in undergraduate courses. This semester, there will be a focus on some critical readings of Wittgenstein's thought. This series of courses (4 in total) will take Wittgenstein and Law as the central theme. The first series (Wittgenstein and Law – I) to be offered this semester has the following objectives: (i) to provide an introduction to the relevance of Wittgenstein's thought and the linguistic turn associated with his philosophy for contemporary legal theory; (ii) to offer an introduction to Wittgenstein's thought (reading and method); (iii) to present some reference works in legal theory that highlight the commitment of some strands of legal thought to certain

philosophical theses explicitly criticized by Wittgensteinian thought. In later versions (Wittgenstein and Law II, III, and IV), the following themes will be addressed: (i) the concept of rule and legal rationality; (ii) the crisis of representation, objectivity, and certainty; (iii) legal thought and the issue of private language; (iv) variants, uses, and abuses of Wittgenstein's thought in legal theory. This semester, particular attention will be given to the theme of the refutation of moral skepticism. To this end, the course will situate the problem within the philosophical-legal context and subsequently analyze Wittgenstein's work *On Certainty* and the notion of hinge concept.

Challenges and general purposes: Wittgenstein is one of the most important contemporary philosophers. His thought has influenced not only the fields of logic and epistemology but also ethics, social sciences, and law. However, understanding his thought is a significant challenge due to the well-known technical difficulties it presents, as well as his innovative and complex style. For this reason, the program seeks to balance a didactic and introductory dimension with the presentation of its relevance to legal thought. The modules (there will be 4 in total) will aim to offer autonomous units, so that following one of them will be a prerequisite for the student's learning. Nevertheless, readings from previous modules may be considered as introductions to better accompany the subsequent module.

Students are expected to put more effort into reading the texts to be discussed than to have prior philosophical knowledge in the field of philosophy of language. There will be weekly seminars, to be conducted in groups or pairs, consisting of an oral presentation and a written handout of the text read. Thus, the course aims to encourage students to organize themselves to work in groups and to develop oral presentation skills using visual aids such as PowerPoint and others.

The course also aims, more generally, to enhance students' ability to participate in plenary discussions (with peers and the professor) by encouraging serious debate based on the texts.

This course aims to present a critical and contemporary debate on Wittgenstein's thought and the Law.

## COMMENTS

- 1) This course presupposes a good command of the English language, as its primary bibliography does not include translation.
- 2) Students must be available for an average weekly reading load of around 60 pages of theoretical texts of reasonable complexity and difficulty. Rigour and care are required when reading texts.
- 3) Reading Hart's Concept of Law and the text "Law as a system of rules" in Taking Rights Seriously by Ronald Dworkin is strongly recommended.
- 4) The course will be organized in the form of a seminar where effective participation from students will be required in all classes.
- 5) The course's final assessment will be done through individual work.
- 6) For guidance on how to present seminars on structural text reading techniques, it is recommended to read the following text: "The structural reading method (Texts in Debate)" by Ronaldo Porto Macedo Jr, Ronaldo Porto Macedo Jr, chapter I by Macedo Jr, Ronaldo Porto (org) Filosofia Política, Atlas, 2008, also in Cadernos Direito GV nº 16 - mar/2007, available for download at <http://www.direitogv.com.br/interna.aspx?PagId=HTKCNKWI&IDCategory=4&IDSubCategory=84>
- 7) It is recommended that you read the book MACEDO JR by Ronaldo Porto. 2013. From Chess to Courtesy: Dworkin and contemporary legal theory. São Paulo: Saraiva.
- 8) The reading of Wittgenstein's On certainty is mandatory.

## **RULES AND DEADLINES FOR CARRYING OUT MANDATORY ACTIVITIES**

Any questions regarding deadlines, summary issues, seminar dates and groups, or any other matters not related to the course content should be addressed exclusively with the teaching assistants.

### **Weekly Question and Answer (All Students)**

- All students must formulate a question weekly about the texts discussed that week, as well as provide an answer to it.

- The question must necessarily pertain to the text read, and the elements for the answer must be found in the bibliography covered in the course up to the point when the question is answered.
- Printed or handwritten questions and answers or those submitted after the deadline will not be accepted.
- Answers must be sent as an attached file (MS Word or similar, except Notepad (.txt)) via email (half a page, Times New Roman font, size 12, single spacing) with the following filename format including the student's first and last name: "firstname\_lastname\_summaryXX" (e.g., joesilva\_summary03). This should also be the subject of the email. The file name should not contain any periods (e.g., joesilva.summary03).
- The student's name and the corresponding seminar number must be included in the submitted text.
- Every student must submit a printed copy in the corresponding class and also send an electronic copy to the following email: danilo.epereira@usp.br.
- No grades will be assigned, nor will written corrections be provided for this activity. However, submission will be noted and considered during the course evaluation.

### **Hand-out (Only for Students Presenting the Seminar)**

- The hand-out should be photocopied and distributed in class to colleagues on the day of the seminar.
- It should also be sent by email to danilo.epereira@usp.br.
- The sent file should be named "handout\_seminarXX" (e.g., handout\_seminar02). This should also be the subject of the email. The file name should not contain any periods (e.g., josedsilva.handout03).
- The students' names should be included in the submitted text, along with the seminar number and the bibliographic reference of the text from which the hand-out was prepared.

### **Presentation:**

- The presentation should last around 12 to 14 minutes.
- "Weave" the mental outline well: introduction | development | conclusion.
- Use hooks at the beginning and end of the presentation (avoid: "That's basically what I had to say").

- Use a cheat sheet or outline, with the sequence of main points. The text should be presented as a whole, meaning its structure should be absolutely clear.
- Do not read directly from notes during the presentation; the presentation should not be a reading of the hand-out.
- Using PowerPoint is recommended but not mandatory. Create concise, legible, and primarily visual slides: avoid overloading them with information. Generally, a 12-minute presentation should not involve more than 8 slides.
- During the PowerPoint presentation, remember that it is not a teleprompter.
- Use a pointer and do not face the screen; look at the audience.
- Practice with a timed rehearsal (hide your watch during the presentation).
- Before starting, carefully check the environment and eliminate any potential distractions.
- Pay attention to your speech (voice, intonation, and pronunciation) and body language (facial expression, gestures, and posture).
- Do not get flustered by distractions. Stay calm and try to engage with the audience.
- Avoid improvisation.
- Remember that this is a presentation for an audience that has already read the text.
- Save external critiques and comments for the debate, not the presentation. After all, the seminar begins after the presentation.
- Note: For seminar presentations, all group members should be prepared to deliver the entire presentation. If any member(s) is/are absent, the other(s) must unconditionally replace them.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE CONTEMPORARY DEBATE IN LEGAL THEORY IN THE ANALYTICAL TRADITION**

- Raymond Wack, *A Very Short introduction to Philosophy of Law*, Oxford University Press, poderá servir de (breve) guia para o debate analisado durante todo o curso e poderá ser lido com proveito no início dos encontros.
- Neil MacCormick, *H. L. A. Hart*, Elsevier, 2009 e de Brian Bix, *Jurisprudence: theory and context*. 3. Ed., Carolina Academic Press, North Carolina, 2004, além, é claro, de O conceito de Direito, de H.L.A. Hart, já traduzido para o português (a tradução portuguesa da Calouste Gulbenkian é superior à tradução da LMF).

- DWORKIN, Ronald. *Law's Empire*, Oxford/Portland: Hart Publishing, 2008; publicado inicialmente em 1986.
- POSTEMA, G.J.A *Treatise Of Legal Philosophy And General Jurisprudence*, SPRINGER, 2011, Páginas: 643.

### **RECOMMENDED READINGS**

- MACCORMICK, Neil. H. L. A. Hart. Tradução de Cláudia Santana Martins. Revisão técnica de Carla Henriete Bevilacqua. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2010 (especialmente 17-60).
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. *Do Xadrez à Cortesia*. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2013.
- SHAPIRO, Scott J. 'The "Hart-Dworkin" Debate: a Short Guide for the Perplexed' in RIPSTEIN, Arthur (Ed.) *Ronald Dworkin*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007, disponível em <http://ssrn.com/abstract=968657>.
- KENNY, Anthony John Patrick. *Wittgenstein*, Rev. ed. 2005, pags. 36-44
- MCGINN, Marie. *Elucidating the Tractatus: Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Logic and Language*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2006
- MORRIS, Michael. *Routledge Philosophy GuideBook to Wittgenstein and the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. Routledge, 2008
- HACKER, P. M. S. *Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytic Philosophy*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.

### **COMPLEMENTARY READINGS ABOUT WITTGENSTEIN**

- ALLAN, James. *Truth's Empire: a reply to ronald dworkin's objectivity and truth*: 26 *Australian Journal of Legal Philosophy*, 2001.
- ANSCOMBE, Elizabeth. *Modern Moral Theory*, in *Philosophy* 33, n. 124, January 1958. reprinted in *Ethics, Religion and Politics (The Collected Philosophical Papers of G. E. M. Anscombe, Volume 3)*, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1981. pp. 26–42.

- ANSCOMBE, G. E. M. “Modern Moral Philosophy.” *Philosophy* 33, no. 124 (1958): Cambridge University Press, 1–19. Disponível em: <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3749051>.>
- BAKER, G.P.; HACKER, P.M.s.. *Scepticism, Rules & Language*. Oxford: Oxford: Blackwell, 1984.
- BARBOSA FILHO, Balthazar. Nota sobre o conceito de jogo-de-linguagem nas “Investigações” de Wittgenstein. In: DALL’AGNOL, Darlei (Org.). *Wittgenstein no Brasil*. São Paulo: Escuta, 2008. p. 163-192.
- BARBOSA FILHO, Balthazar. Nota sobre o conceito de jogo-de-linguagem nas “Investigações” de Wittgenstein. In: DALL’AGNOL, Darlei (Org.). *Wittgenstein no Brasil*. São Paulo: Escuta, 2008. p. 163-192.
- BONCOMPAGNI, Anna. *Wittgenstein and Pragmatism: on certainty in the light of peirce and james*. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.
- CAVELL, Stanley. *The Availability of Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy* 44-73, in CAVELL, Stanley. *Must we mean what we say?* Nova York: Scribner, 1969.
- COLIVA, Annalisa. *Mind, Meaning, and Knowledge: themes from the philosophy of crispin wright*. London: O, 2012.
- COLIVA, Annalisa. *Moore and Wittgenstein: scepticism, certainty and common sense (history of analytic philosophy)*. United Kigndom: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- COSTA, Maira de Cinque Pereira da. *Impossibilidade da dúvida radical: uma resposta ao ceticismo no livro da certeza de wittgenstein*. São Paulo: USP, 2011
- DWORKIN, Ronald *Objectivity and truth: You'd better believe it*, *Philosophy and Public Affairs*; Spring 1996; 25, 2; Research Library Core.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. 1996. *Objectivity and Truth: You’d better believe it*, *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, vol. 25, n. 2., p. 87-139.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. 2001a. “Do liberal values conflict?”. In: DWORKIN, Ronald; LILLA, Mark; SILVERS, Robert. *The Legacy of Isaiah Berlin*. New York: The New York Review of Books, pp. 91-104.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. 2005. *Uma questão de princípio*. 2ª Ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. 2011. *Justice for Hedgehogs*. Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.
- FOGELIN, Robert J. *Wittgenstein: The Arguments of the Philosophers*. London: Routledge, 1995.

- FREGE, Gottlob, LÓGICA E FILOSOFIA DA LINGUAGEM, trad. ALCOFORADO, Paulo, 2ª Edição, EDUSP
- FREGE, Gottlob. O Pensamento. Uma Investigação Lógica. In: ALCOFORADO, Paulo (Org.). Cadernos de Tradução: Investigações lógicas e outros ensaios. Trad. e notas de Paulo Alcoforado. São Paulo: EDIPE.
- FREGE, Gottlob. Sobre a Justificação Científica de uma Conceitografia. Tradução e introdução de Luiz Henrique Lopes dos Santos. São Paulo: Abril, 1974.
- GEACH, Peter. Translations from the Philosophical Writings of Gottlob Frege. Blackwell, 1970.
- GLOCK, Hans-Johann. DICIONARIO WITTGENSTEIN, Zahar
- GLOCK, Hans-Johann. O que é filosofia analítica? Porto Alegre: Penso Editora, 2011.
- Guest, Stephen, Ronald Dworkin (1991), Stanford University Press, California. (existe tradução para o Português pela Elsevier, 2010)
- GUEST, Stephen. Ronald Dworkin. USA: Stanford Law Books, 3rd ed. 2012
- HACKER, P. M. S. Analytic philosophy: beyond the linguistic turn and back again. In: BEANEY, M. (Ed.). The Analytic turn: analysis in early analytic philosophy and phenomenology. London: Routledge, 2007. p. 125-141.
- HACKER, P. M. S. Definition in jurisprudence. The Philosophical Quarterly, Hoboken, v. 19, n. 77, p. 343-347, Oct. 1969.
- HACKER, P. M. S. Hart's Philosophy of Law. In: HACKER, P. M. S.; RAZ, Joseph (Eds.). Law, morality and society: essays in honour of H. L. A. Hart. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977. p. 1-25.
- HACKER, P. M. S. Wittgenstein's place in twentieth-century analytic philosophy. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.
- HACKER, P.M.S. Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytic Philosophy. Nova Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell, 1996
- HACKING, Ian. Por que a linguagem interessa à filosofia. São Paulo: EDUNESP, 1999.
- HAMILTON, Andy. - Routledge Philosophy GuideBook to Wittgenstein and On Certainty. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- HERMANN, Julia. On Moral Certainty, Justification and Practice: a wittgensteinian perspective. Londres: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- KENNY, Anthony John Patrick, Wittgenstein. Wiley-Blackwell, 2005.

- KENNY, Anthony John Patrick. Cartesian Privacy. In: PITCHER, George. The Philosophy of Wittgenstein. 2nd ed. New York: Anchor Books, 1966. p. 352-370.
- KLEIN, Peter D. Certainty in Action: a refutation of scepticism. Mineápolis: University Of Minnesota Press, 1981.
- LEE, Barry. Philosophy of Language: The Key Thinkers. Continuum, 2011.
- MACEDO JR, Ronaldo Porto. 2013. Do Xadrez à Cortesia: Dworkin e a teoria do direito contemporânea. São Paulo: Saraiva.
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. Como dar seminários sobre textos conceitualmente complexos. In: FEFERBAUM Marina; GHIRARDI, José Garcez (Orgs.). Ensino do direito para um mundo em transformação (São Paulo: Fundação Getulio Vargas, 2012<sup>a</sup>) pp. 95-146. (Coleção Acadêmica Livre). Disponível em: <[http://direitogv.fgv.br/sites/direitogv.fgv.br/files/arquivos/anexos/ensino\\_do\\_direito\\_para\\_um\\_mundo\\_em\\_transformacao.pdf](http://direitogv.fgv.br/sites/direitogv.fgv.br/files/arquivos/anexos/ensino_do_direito_para_um_mundo_em_transformacao.pdf)>. Acesso em: 16 jul. 2013.
- MALCOLM, Norman. Knowledge and Certainty: essays and lectures. Nova York: Cornell University Press, 1975.
- MARTINICH, A.P. The Philosophy of Language, Fourth Edition. Oxford University Press, 2012.
- MCGINN, Marie (1997), Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations, London: Routledge
- MCGINN, Marie. Elucidating the Tractatus: Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Logic and Language. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2006
- MEDINA, José. The Unity of Wittgenstein's Philosophy: Necessity, Intelligibility, and Normativity. State of University of New York Press, 2002.
- MORAWETZ., Thomas. Wittgenstein & Knowledge: the importance of on certainty. Massachusetts: University Of Massachusetts Press, 1978.
- MORRIS, Michael. Routledge Philosophy GuideBook to Wittgenstein and the Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus. Routledge, 2008.
- MOYAL-SHARROCK, Danièle ; Munz, Volker & Coliva, Annalisa (eds.) (2015). Mind, Language and Action: Proceedings of the 36th International Wittgenstein Symposium. De Gruyter.
- MOYAL-SHARROCK, Danièle. Certainty in Action: wittgenstein on language, mind and epistemology. Usa: Bloomsbury Academic, 2021.
- MOYAL-SHARROCK, Danièle. Understanding Wittgenstein's On Certainty. Londres: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004

- MOYAL-SHARROCK, Danièle; BRENNER, William. (eds) Readings of Wittgenstein's On Certainty. Londres: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005.
- NEF, Frédéric. A Linguagem: Uma Abordagem Filosófica. Zahar, 1995.
- RHEES, Rush; PHILLIPS, D. Z. (editor) Wittgenstein's On Certainty: there - like our life. Nova Jersey: Wiley-Blackwell, 2003.
- SANTOS, Luiz Henrique Lopes dos. A Essência da Proposição e a Essência do Mundo. In: WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Tractatus logico-philosophicus. São Paulo: Edusp, 2001
- SANTOS, Luiz Henrique Lopes dos. O Olho e o Microscópio: A Gênese e os Fundamentos da Lógica segundo Frege. Nau, 2008.
- SCHMITZ, François. Wittgenstein (trad. José Oscar de A. Marques). São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 2004.
- STERN, David G. As Investigações Filosóficas de Wittgenstein: uma Introdução. Tradução de Marcelo Carvalho e Fernando L. Aquino. São Paulo: Annablume, 2012. (Coleção Filosofia e Linguagem).
- STERN, David G. Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction (Cambridge Introductions to Key Philosophical Texts). Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- STROLL, Avrum. Moore and Wittgenstein on Certainty. Usa: Oxford University Press, 1994
- SUMARES, Manuel. Sobre "Da Certeza", de Ludwig Wittgenstein: um estudo introdutório. Edições Afrontamento, 2005.
- van Roojen, Mark, "Moral Cognitivism vs. Non-Cognitivism", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2018 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL <<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2018/entries/moral-cognitivism/>>
- WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Philosophical Investigations. 4th ed. Edited by P. M. S. Hacker and Joachim Schulte. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009.
- WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. The Blue and Brown Books. Oxford: Blackwell, 1969.
- WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Da Certeza. Portugal: Edições 70, 2012
- WITTGENSTEIN, Ludwig. Investigações Filosóficas. 2. ed. Brasil: UNICAMP, 2017

## BIBLIOGRAPHY ON LEGAL THEORY AND WITTGENSTEIN

- ARULANANTHAM, Ahilan T. Breaking the rules? Wittgenstein and legal realism. *Yale Law Journal*, New Haven, v. 107, p. 1853-1884, Apr. 1998.
- BIX, Brian. Cautions and Caveats for the Application of Wittgenstein to Legal Theory. *LAW AND SOCIAL JUSTICE*, Campbell, O'Rourke & Shier, eds., MIT Press, pp. 217-229, 2005; Minnesota Legal Studies Research Paper No. 05-2. Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=619123>
- BIX, Brian. Can Theories of Meaning and Reference Solve the Problem of Legal Determinacy? Available at SSRN: at: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=619123>
- BIX, Brian. H. L. A. Hart and the “open texture” of language. *Law and Philosophy*, v. 10, n. 1, p. 51-72, Feb. 1991. disponível em: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3504835>. Acesso em: 20 ago. 2012.
- BIX, Brian. H. L. A. Hart and the hermeneutic turn in legal theory. *Southern Methodist University Law Review*, Dallas, v. 52, p. 167-199, 1999a. Disponível em: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=163810](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=163810).
- BIX, Brian. *Law, language and legal determinacy*. Oxford: Clarendon, 1993.
- BIX, Brian. Patrolling the boundaries: inclusive legal positivism and the nature of jurisprudential debate. *Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence*, Ontario, v. 12, p. 17-33, 1999b.
- BIX, Brian. Some reflections on methodology in jurisprudence (translated into Italian). *Ars Interpretandi*, Padova, v. 8, p. 297-427, 2004.
- BIX, Brian. The application (and mis-application) of Wittgenstein’s rule-following considerations to legal theory. In: BIX, Brian. *Law, language and legal determinacy*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993. p. 36-62.
- CAVELL, Stanley. The availability of Wittgenstein's later philosophy. In: PITCHER, George. *The philosophy of Wittgenstein*. 2nd ed. New York: Anchor Books, 1966. p. 151-185.
- MARMOR, Andrei (ed.) *Direito e interpretação*. Tradução de Luís Carlos Borges. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2000.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. *Law’s empire*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1986.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. Objectivity and truth: you'd better believe it. *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, Hoboken, v. 25, p. 87-139, 1996b.

- DWORKIN, Ronald. Legal Theory and the problem of sense. In: GAVISON, R. (Ed.). Issues in encyclopedia of philosophy. 2003.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. Justice for Hedgehogs. Nova York: Belknap Press, 2013.
- DWORKIN, Ronald. On interpretation and Objectivity. In: A matter of principle Nova York: Harvard University Press, 1986.
- o FEFERBAUM Marina; GHIRARDI, José Garcez (Orgs.). Ensino do direito para um mundo em transformação. São Paulo: Fundação Getúlio Vargas, 2012a. p. 95-146. (Coleção Acadêmica Livre). Disponível em: [http://direitogv.fgv.br/sites/direitogv.fgv.br/files/arquivos/anexos/ensino\\_do\\_direito\\_para\\_um\\_mundo\\_em\\_transformacao.pdf](http://direitogv.fgv.br/sites/direitogv.fgv.br/files/arquivos/anexos/ensino_do_direito_para_um_mundo_em_transformacao.pdf)
- HALPIN, Andrew. The methodology of jurisprudence: thirty years off the point. Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence, Ontario, v. 19, p. 67-105, 2006. Disponível em: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=880803](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=880803).
- HART, H. L. A. O conceito de direito. 3. ed. Tradução de A. Ribeiro Mendes. Lisboa: Calouste
- HART, H. L. A. Ensaios sobre teoria e filosofia do direito. Tradução de José Garcez Ghirardi e Lenita Maria Rimoli Esteves. Revisão de Ronaldo Porto Macedo Junior e Leonardo Gomes Penteado Rosa. São Paulo: Elsevier, 2010. (Coleção Teoria e Filosofia do Direito).
- HART, H. L. A. The concept of law. 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994a.
- HART, H. L. A. Edited by: Ruth Gavison. Issues in contemporary legal philosophy: The Influence of H.L.A Hart. Oxford: Clarendon, 1987. p. 14.
- LEITER, Brian. Naturalizing jurisprudence: essays on American legal realism and naturalism in legal philosophy. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- MACCORMICK, Neil. H. L. A. Hart. Tradução de Cláudia Santana Martins. Revisão técnica de Carla Henriete Bevilacqua. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2010.
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. As várias lições de H. L. A. Hart. In: HART, H. L. A. Ensaios sobre teoria e filosofia do direito. Tradução de José Garcez Ghirardi e Lenita Maria Rimoli Esteves. Revisão de Ronaldo Porto Macedo Junior e Leonardo Gomes Penteado Rosa. São Paulo: Elsevier, 2010. p. IX-XVI. (Coleção Teoria e Filosofia do Direito).
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. Como dar seminários sobre textos conceitualmente complexos. In:

- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. Do xadrez à cortesia: Dworkin e a teoria do direito contemporânea. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2013a.
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. O método de leitura estrutural. In: MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto. (Org.). Filosofia política. São Paulo: Atlas, 2008.
- MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto; BARBIERI, Catarina Helena Cortada (Orgs.). Direito e interpretação: racionalidades e instituições. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2011.
- o MARIAN, David, Edward N. Zalta (ed.). The Correspondence Theory of Truth, The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Available at: <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2013/entries/truth-correspondence/>.
- MARMOR, Andrei (Ed.). Law and interpretation. Oxford: Clarendon, 1995.
- MORAWETZ, Thomas. Understanding disagreement: the root issue of jurisprudence: applying Wittgenstein to positivism, critical theory, and judging. University of Pennsylvania Law Review, v. 141, p. 371-456, Dec. 1992.
- PATTERSON, Dennis (Ed.). Wittgenstein and legal theory. Boulder: Westview Press, 1992.
- PATTERSON, Dennis. Após a análise conceitual: a ascensão da teoria da prática. In: MACEDO JUNIOR, Ronaldo Porto; BARBIERI, Catarina Helena Cortada (Orgs.). Direito e interpretação: racionalidades e instituições. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2011. p. 193-210.
- PATTERSON, Dennis. Law and truth. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- PATTERSON, Dennis. Wittgenstein and constitutional theory. Texas Law Review, v. 72, p. 1837-1856, June 1994.
- PATTERSON, Dennis. Wittgenstein and the code: a theory of good faith performance and enforcement under article nine. University of Pennsylvania Law Review, v. 137, p. 335-430, 1988.
- PENCO, Carlo. Introdução à Filosofia da Linguagem. Petrópolis. RJ: Vozes, 2006.
- POSTEMA, G.J.A Treatise of Legal Philosophy And General Jurisprudence, SPRINGER, 2011.
- POSTEMA, G.J.A Objectivity Fit for Law in, Objectivity in Law and Morals , pp. 99 – 143, Brian Leiter, Cambridge University Press: 2009
- SEBOK, Anthony J. Finding Wittgenstein at the core of the rule of recognition. Southern Methodist University Law Review, v. 52, p. 75-110, winter 1999.

- STAVROPOULOS, Nicos. Interpretivist theories of law. In: ZALTA, Edward (Ed.). Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 2008. Disponível em: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/law-interpretivist>
- STAVROPOULOS, Nicos. Objectivity in law. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996.
- Sayre-McCord, Geoff, "Moral Realism", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Summer 2021 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/moral-realism/>.
- WALDRON, Jeremy The Irrelevance of Moral Objectivity in Law and Disagreement; Lonsewa, Oxford University Press, 1999
- WILLIAMS, Bernard. Ethics and the Limits of Philosophy. Londres: Routledge, 2006
- WOLCHER, Louis E. Ronald Dworkin's Right answers thesis through the lens of Wittgenstein. Rutgers Law Journal, v. 29, p. 43-66, 1997.

#### **RECOMMENDED VIDEOS AND PODCASTS:**

- Recording of Prof. Alice Crary: "Wittgenstein and Ethics," lecture given on June 2, 2005 at the "Wittgenstein, Philosophy & Language" conference in Skjolden, Norway, June 1-4, 2005. At [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zFSrTirT\\_KA&list=PLP9Rm\\_nC0LsHOvL869oI6dB9fMTj8cAjK&index=32&t=93s](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zFSrTirT_KA&list=PLP9Rm_nC0LsHOvL869oI6dB9fMTj8cAjK&index=32&t=93s)
- On Uncertainty: Wittgenstein: Habits of Thought and Thoughts of Habit at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PXONvpL2S40&t=624s>
- Ep. 38 - Wittgenstein: pensamento, linguagem e realidade | Entrevista com Luiz Henrique dos Santos, in <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=W191ZFBLW2k&t=1s>
- Moore's Argument Against Skepticism, at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=i7zt-tEYpoU>
- Wittgenstein e o anticeticismo contemporâneo - prof. dr. Nicola Claudio Salvatore (Unisinos) at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GtcQ3dMJCQY&t=3399s>
- Neste vídeo o professor e doutor Paulo Roberto Monteiro de Araujo entrevista João Vergílio Cutter. At <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=G6OJ2XnBmns&t=90s>
- Annalisa Coliva at the conf. Wittgenstein: Naturalism and Necessity, Univ. of Bergen Nov. 2019 at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dobbEnKQVYA>

- G.E. Moore, "Certainty" (2), at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EdVkvKDpypA>
- "Love and Other Demons: Wittgenstein and Skepticism," with José Medina, professor of philosophy at Vanderbilt University. At <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XvvYJxvGVPQ&t=53s>
- [https://open.spotify.com/episode/16ewlZ9tFZTo7aDnhLORld?si=717F\\_k3mTx-a\\_PBrKZGbZQ](https://open.spotify.com/episode/16ewlZ9tFZTo7aDnhLORld?si=717F_k3mTx-a_PBrKZGbZQ)